

# Exhibit C

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 15, 2021  
Start: 1:55 p.m.  
Recess: 5:40 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey D. Johnson  
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Diana Ayala  
Inez D. Barron  
Joseph Borelli  
Justin Brannan  
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
Tiffany Cabàn  
Fernando Cabrera  
David M. Carr  
Margaret S. Chin  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
Darma V. Diaz  
Eric Dinowitz  
Daniel Dromm  
Mathieu Eugene  
Oswald Feliz  
James F. Gennaro  
Deborah L. Gibson

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Council Members:

Mark S. Gjonaj  
Barry S. Grodenchik  
Robert F. Holden  
Ben Kallos  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Farah N. Louis  
Alan N. Maisel  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco P. Moya  
Bill Perkins  
Keith Powers  
Antonio Reynoso  
Kevin C. Riley  
Carlina Rivera  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Inna Vernikov  
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S

Reverend Mark Erson  
Pastor and Spiritual Leader at St. John's  
Lutheran Church

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   23

2           SPEAKER JOHNSON:   I vote aye.

3           COUNCIL CLERK:   Thank you.

4           MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO:   Okay, all Land

5   Use Call Ups were adopted in the affirmative in a

6   vote of 46 in the affirmative, zero negative and zero

7   abstentions.

8           We will now have communication from

9   Speaker Corey Johnson.

10          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Thank you Madam

11   Majority Leader.   Good afternoon everyone.   Happy

12   Wednesday, welcome to today's Stated Meeting.   The

13   last Stated Meeting of this City Council's

14   legislative session.   As I usually do, I want to

15   remind all members that masks are required to be worn

16   throughout the Stated, even when speaking.

17          Today, we're voting on 28 Bills and 13

18   Resolutions.   Among the Bills is one to ban the use

19   of gas in new buildings, helping us transition to a

20   greener future.   This legislation is part of our

21   efforts to protect our environment and to reach

22   carbon neutrality by the year 2050.   Also, as

23   prepared food is a growing part of New Yorkers diets,

24   this afternoon we're voting on a bill to require

25   added sugar notification in the menu of chain

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   46  
2   sponsored by Council Member Rafael Salamanca will  
3   allow sidewalk café applicants to prepare their own  
4   plans rather than use an architect. For these two  
5   bills, I want to thank Stephanie Jones, Leah Skrzpiec  
6   and Noah Meixler.

7           Now, from the Committee on Health, we  
8   have Introduction Number 1326 A sponsored by the  
9   Chair Mark Levine that will require added sugar  
10   notifications in chain restaurant menus. From the  
11   staff, I want to thank Sara Liss, Harbani Ahuja,  
12   Jayasri Ganapathy and Zeah Manuel Halu(SP?).

13           Our last Bill of the day and of the  
14   2018-2021 legislative session will help us curve,  
15   will help us reach the city's net zero for carbon  
16   neutrality by 2050. We're in a climate crisis and we  
17   must take all necessary steps to fight climate change  
18   and protect our city. Introduction 2317 A sponsored  
19   by Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel will ban the  
20   combustion of substances with certain emission  
21   profiles in new buildings in certain renovations.  
22   This bill will direct the Commissioner of Buildings  
23   to deny construction documents and permits in  
24   connection with a new building that would require the  
25   combustion of the substances with some exceptions. I

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   47  
2   want to thank from the staff Genan Zilka, Samara  
3   Swanston, Nadia Johnson, Ricky Challah, Brad Reed and  
4   Terzah Nasser. That is our final agenda and this  
5   final Stated Meeting of the New York City Council for  
6   this legislative session.

7           And with that, with gratitude, what  
8   thanks to you Madam Majority Leader for presiding  
9   over this body in a very great way over the last four  
10   years, I turn it back to you.

11           MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so much  
12   Speaker Corey Johnson for that very robust  
13   legislative package. We will now move into  
14   discussion of General Orders.

15           Seeing that we have on the docket, we  
16   will begin with Council Member Gennaro followed by  
17   Council Member Rosenthal, Rivera, Kallos, and Chin  
18   and then Koo.

19           COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you Madam  
20   Majority Leader. Regarding Intro. 2317 A, which the  
21   Speaker just referenced, [INAUDIBLE 49:49]. I thank  
22   Council Member Ampry-Samuel for her leadership and  
23   putting forward this great bill, which will  
24   ultimately lead the city to an all-electric city  
25   drawing from 100 percent green and renewable grid.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   48

2   We are light years away from that now but this puts  
3   us irreversibly on that course. This bill alone will  
4   yield a savings of 2.1 million tons of Co2 by 2040,  
5   which is equal to the carbon as reduced from 450,000  
6   cars in a whole year. But that is just the  
7   beginning. When first put forward this bill was more  
8   of a concept bill and the journey of this bill from  
9   concept at detailed final bill was one of the most  
10   difficult negotiations of the hundreds of  
11   negotiations I have done over the years. And with  
12   stakeholder meetings with advocates, industry, labor  
13   and the Administration, including the Mayor himself  
14   was the most challenging.

15           I thank Council Member Ampry-Samuel for  
16   being steadfast on the elements of the bill that were  
17   a must for her. I thank the Speaker and Jason  
18   Goldman for their great leadership and for giving  
19   what I thought was the most ambitious yet  
20   implementable possible. And very special thanks to  
21   Jeff Baker for being with me the whole way to get the  
22   great bill to what we have today. One that will be a  
23   template for the nation as we charter course through  
24   a carbon neutral future. Special thanks as well for  
25   Paul Ochoa and Ben Ferguson from the Administration



1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   49  
2   and to [INAUDIBLE 51:13] and Advanced Energy Studies  
3   [INAUDIBLE 51:18] who provided critical guidance and  
4   to my wonderful LB Maddie Cower(SP?) for her great  
5   work on this bill. But we wouldn't be here today  
6   without Council Member Ampry-Samuel's vision. So, I  
7   will end where I began in thanking her for putting  
8   this bill forward and being a great advocate for it.  
9   Her legacy is a green city and a growing green  
10   economy to get us there.

11           SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

12           COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you very  
13   much. Thank you very much.

14           MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll  
15   now have Council Member Rosenthal then Rivera.

16           COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
17   much. I'm proud to speak today about my bills that  
18   are passing. We owe a debt of gratitude to our  
19   Speaker, Corey Johnson whose brilliant staff  
20   negotiated the strongest language possible to help  
21   all New Yorkers. Because of their work, all job  
22   postings must include salary ranges which have been  
23   shown to close the gender pay gap. We have to  
24   address street harassment, which many of us have  
25   experienced particularly women, the LGBTQAI plus

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   59

2                   Thank you also to Speaker Johnson and  
3 Chair Holden. All the advocates who supported this  
4 bill and my own staff. Thank you. Happy holidays.

5                   MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Council Member  
6 Lander.

7                   COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very  
8 much Madam Majority Leader. I'll save my mushy  
9 remarks for when I vote to speak to bills now.

10                   First, I'm so excited about Intro. 2317  
11 A, that Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel is  
12 sponsoring to transform our city into an all-electric  
13 city. We do not have time to continue to burn fossil  
14 fuels. I want to give props to the coalition that  
15 fought for that and I want to give special props to  
16 Alicka Ampry-Samuel because I know it was a big,  
17 strong fight.

18                   We have a lot of work to do to make sure  
19 that we convert our energy grid to solar and wind and  
20 renewables, so that the energy power that is powering  
21 our buildings is clean and renewable as well. And I  
22 look forward to fighting hard to continue that in the  
23 Comptroller's office and I know this body will as  
24 well.

25

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   65  
2   my colleagues discussions on this bill. For those of  
3   you that cosponsored it and supported it, I  
4   appreciate your collaboration. I'm hopeful that this  
5   bill will pass in the next session. This is a bill  
6   that is about affording everybody in our city, all of  
7   us who are Gods children, the right to dignity with a  
8   roof over their head. Whether they have a criminal  
9   history or not. Everybody deserves to have a home.  
10   And so, I'm disappointed that this bill is not  
11   passing today but I am very confident, very confident  
12   that in the future this legislation will pass and I  
13   look forward to seeing that day here in the New York  
14   City Council. And I'll come back on my next round to  
15   talk about that. [APPLAUSE]

16           MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you Council  
17   Member Levin, we'll now go to Council Member Ampry-  
18   Samuel followed by Borelli.

19           COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Our city  
20   and state has set lofty goals to reduce our gas  
21   related emissions. As many children of the 70's and  
22   80's, I remember celebrating Earth Day and taking  
23   personal responsibility for the earth and  
24   environment. We people have had to contend with the  
25

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   66  
2       effects of global warming in the forms of record  
3       breaking fatal weather events year after year.

4           The responsibility has always been on  
5       individuals. Multiuse water bottles, shorter  
6       showers, home recycling, this Council also prohibited  
7       single use straws, plastic bags and reduce the usage  
8       of plastic flatware. We have literally made personal  
9       environmental responsibility a letter of the law.  
10      But buildings are responsible for nearly half of the  
11      greenhouse emissions that are destroying our earth  
12      every day.

13           Today, is the last Stated of this Council  
14      term and it has been an honor and privilege to  
15      represent my community where we see a 32 percent  
16      higher exposure rate to dangerous pollutants from  
17      greenhouse emissions. A community where the Council  
18      staff recognizes best practices and believes in New  
19      York as a leader. So much so that they brought this  
20      idea to me in its infancy stages. Immediately  
21      recognizing the intersectionality of climate and  
22      racial justice. I knew that this was a charge that  
23      the 41st Council must have set. Together, we worked  
24      tirelessly with advocates to develop this bill and  
25      push it through.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   67

2           Although we have few surprising allies,  
3 we have some surprising challengers as well. But we  
4 held strong and as we look to the future, I thank  
5 Speaker Johnson and my colleagues for supporting this  
6 gas ban bill which essentially codifies our emission  
7 reduction goals. And I thank Jim Gennaro, excuse me,  
8 I thank Council Member Gennaro – can you give me one  
9 minute?

10           I thank Council Member Gennaro for  
11 helping me to sharpen my debate skills. That was  
12 quite the challenge. So, as I come to a close with  
13 my remarks and my time in the Council, I thank all of  
14 the advocates that gave us a master class and data  
15 for days on emissions, gas, the grid, pollutants. I  
16 thank Pete Sikora and Johnathan, We Act NYCC and  
17 countless others. And I want to really thank Jeff  
18 and Jason for working so hard because I know at  
19 midnight on some days, I could have been a bit much.  
20 It was tough but worth the fight.

21           I want to also thank my staff Naomi  
22 Hopkins and my Legislative Director Everton Smith for  
23 their support and also, my staff in the Council,  
24 Jennifer Joseph, Kim Robinson, Christina Serrano,  
25 Takirra Jackson, and Maurice Cummings for their

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   68

2    amazing team work. I want to thank you all and  
3    remind you that climate justice is racial justice.  
4    So, let's keep putting people first. Thank you.

5           MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you Council  
6    Member Ampry-Samuel so much. Council Member Borelli.

7           COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I like to stand  
8    at my desk. I don't like the stand up comedy routine  
9    that we do now. [APPLAUSE] Yes, thank you, thank  
10   you. I feel like Jerry Seinfeld up there you know.

11           I just want to say number one, I will say  
12   my emotional farewell to everyone. I don't see Corey  
13   here but I wanted to say it's been a really wonderful  
14   four years working alongside the Speaker. You know  
15   through all the work the Council did. Even though of  
16   course we disagree many times, it's nice to have a  
17   partner in government and also a friend in government  
18   and I really thank you for your service to the City  
19   of New York. Whatever you go on to do next, that  
20   institution or whatever will be very lucky to have  
21   you. And the rest of you guys, you're not very good,  
22   so. No, I'm kidding.

23           I should have done the stand up comedy  
24   routine. It's been a privilege to work with so many  
25   of you over the past four years. Some of you longer.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   88  
2   2424-B being led by Council Member Rosenthal, where  
3   it will create an advisory board to help address New  
4   Yorkers who continue to be harassed as the walk  
5   through the streets in New York City and we hope that  
6   we'll be able to do some great work with that board.  
7   And with that, I am proud to vote aye on all. Thank  
8   you.

9                   MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10                  COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cabàn?

11                  COUNCIL MEMBER CABÀN: Permission to  
12   explain my vote?

13                  MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
14   granted.

15                  COUNCIL MEMBER CABÀN: Thank you Majority  
16   Leader. First, just congratulations to my colleagues  
17   on passing such wonderful bills today. Particularly,  
18   Council Member Ampry-Samuels gas ban bill. That is  
19   such an incredible achievement. Thank you. I do  
20   really wish that Council Member Levin's Fair Chance  
21   for Housing Bill was on the agenda today too but I do  
22   look forward to passing it next term. And I vote aye  
23   on all with the exception of Intro.'s 2476 and 2439  
24   in which I vote no, thank you.

25                  COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cabrera?

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 7, 2022